A commentary is a resource that criticizes or comments on another work. It may be published independently or in conjunction with the text of the original work.

In LCSH practice, the first subject heading assigned to a commentary is the title or name/title heading for the original work.
Criticisms of an individual work are filed after all of the editions, translations, and selections of the original work.
CSM G 65, *Preferred Shelflist Order*, says that criticisms (and commentaries) of an individual work are assigned the same cutter that the original work was, but “expanded by 3 or 3-39 and date.” That is true most of the time.
In this module, we will explain how commentaries on individual works are classified and also how to complete the call number.

It is based on two CSM instruction sheets, F570, *Commentaries on Individual Works*, and G340, *Criticism/Commentaries*.
The general rule is to classify a commentary with the original work in the original language, unless the schedules say to do something else.
For example, David Waldstreicher’s work *In the Midst of Perpetual Fetes* is classified in E210, so a collection of essays on *In the Midst of Perpetual Fetes* is also classified in E210.
The classification of John Milton’s *Paradise Lost and Paradise Regained* does not follow the general rule to classify commentaries with the original work, because the schedule tells us to do something different.
Texts of *Paradise Lost* in English – the original language – are classified in PR3560.
Criticism of *Paradise Lost* – that is, commentaries on it – are classified in PR3562.
The same pattern holds true for *Paradise Regained*.

Editions are classified in PR3563, while criticism is in PR3565.
The same is true for commentaries on the Qur’an.

Complete Arabic texts are classified in BP100, while commentaries about it are classed in BP130-134.
Criticism of individual parts of the Qur’an, such as Chapter 1, also have different classification numbers than the text. The text of Chapter 1 is in BP128.16.A2, while criticism of Chapter 1 is in BP128.16.A5-Z.

Whenever you see special provisions like this, follow any instructions about subarrangement that appear. If there are not any, follow the default rule to assign a cutter to represent the main entry.

The remainder of this module will focus on the policies for completing the call number when there are no special provisions – in other words, when the commentary is classified in the same number as the original work in the original language.
If the call number for the original work contains only one cutter, then we append a 3 to that cutter, add a second cutter to represent the main entry of the commentary, and then add the date of publication of the commentary.
Let’s look at the David Waldstreicher example again.

The full call number for the original work is E210.W35 1997.
Commentary on the First Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: E210.W35 1997
Creator: Waldstreicher, David
Title: In the midst of perpetual fetes

Commentary
Classification number: E210.W35
Title: Essays on In the midst of perpetual fetes
Date: 2001
Subject heading: Waldstreicher, David. In the midst of perpetual fetes.

To construct the call number for the commentary, we copy the beginning of that call number, E210.W35.
Then we append a 3 to .W35, to make .W353.

Next, we assign a second cutter to represent the title main entry: *Essays on In the Midst of Perpetual Fetes*.

In order to do that, we have to check the catalog to ensure that the criticisms will file in alphabetical order.
Commentary on the First Cutter

Example

Original work
Title: In the midst of perpetual fetes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Call number</th>
<th>Entered under</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E210.W353 S87 2017</td>
<td>Sutton, Mary Beth. Analyzing In the midst of perpetual fetes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We find that there is already one criticism, and it has the call number E210.W353 S87 2017.

The commentary we are cataloging is entered under *Essays*, so we should use the Cutter Table to assign a cutter under E.
Commentary on the First Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: E210.W35 1997
Creator: Waldstreicher, David
Title: In the midst of perpetual fetes

Commentary
Classification number: E210.W353 E87 2001
Title: Essays on In the midst of perpetual fetes
Date: 2001
Subject heading: Waldstreicher, David. In the midst of perpetual fetes.

We can assign E87. Finally, we add the publication date of the commentary.
Let’s look at one another example, during which we will demonstrate every step in the process.

We are cataloging Georgina Smithson’s commentary entitled, *Finding Bentham’s Judicial Evidence*. It is about Jeremy Bentham’s *Rationale of Judicial Evidence*.

The first step is to search the catalog for the original work, and we find that the library has it.
Commentary on the First Cutter

Example

**Original work**
*Classification number: KD7499.B46 1827*
*Creator: Bentham, Jeremy, 1748-1832*
*Title: Rationale of judicial evidence*

**Commentary**
*Classification number:*
*Creator: Smithson, Georgina*
*Title: Finding Bentham's judicial evidence*
*Date: 1999*
*Subject heading: Bentham, Jeremy, 1748-1832. Rationale of judicial evidence.*

It has been classified at KD7499.B46 1827.
It is always a good idea to consult the schedule to see if there are any special instructions for classifying commentaries about the original work.

Bentham’s work is assigned a general number for treatises, and if we were to read up the schedule and also scan the numbers around it, we would see that there are no special instructions. We can now proceed to classify Smithson’s commentary with Bentham’s original work.
Commentary on the First Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: KD7499.B46 1827
Creator: Bentham, Jeremy, 1748-1832
Title: Rationale of judicial evidence

Commentary
Classification number: KD7499.B46
Creator: Smithson, Georgina
Title: Finding Bentham's judicial evidence
Date: 1999
Subject heading: Bentham, Jeremy, 1748-1832.
Rationale of judicial evidence.

The first step is to copy the call number of the original work, excluding the publication date.
Now we append a 3 to the cutter we copied.

Our next step is to search the catalog to determine whether it includes any other commentaries on *Rationale for Judicial Evidence*, and what the call numbers are, if so.
Commentary on the First Cutter

Example

Original work
Title: Rationale of judicial evidence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Call number</th>
<th>Entered under</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KD7499.B463 S63 2006</td>
<td>Smith, Elaine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KD7499.B463 S64 2011</td>
<td>Spencer, Albert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KD7499.B463 S83 1990</td>
<td>Stapleton, John</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It turns out that there are several, including three that are already entered under S. Smithson has to fit between Smith at S63 and Spencer at S64. Let’s assign S635.
Commentary on the First Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: KD7499.B46 1827
Creator: Bentham, Jeremy, 1748-1832
Title: Rationale of judicial evidence

Commentary
Classification number: KD7499.B463 S635 1999
Creator: Smithson, Georgina
Title: Finding Bentham’s judicial evidence
Date: 1999
Subject heading: Bentham, Jeremy, 1748-1832.
Rationale of judicial evidence.

And then we add the publication date of the commentary.
As we can see, this policy creates a very organized array of resources.

Because we appended the 3 to the first cutter, all of the editions of the original work are filed together by date of publication, followed by all of the commentaries in alphabetical order by the main entry.

Let’s move on.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

- Call number of original work has two cutters
  - Append a 3 to the second cutter
  - Represent the commentary
    - Append digits to the second cutter
    - Append the date of publication

We have just described the policy for when the work is assigned a single cutter.

Sometimes the original work has already been assigned two cutters. Since we can have a total of two cutters in a call number (except for some geographic resources), we cannot add another cutter.

Instead, we append a 3 to the second cutter assigned to the original work and then append digits to represent the main entry of the commentary. Finally, we append the date of publication of the commentary.
For our first example, we are cataloging a commentary of Alice Walker’s *The Color Purple*.

The first step is to search the catalog to discover where *The Color Purple* is classified.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: PS3573.A425 C6 1982
Creator: Walker, Alice, 1944-
Title: The color purple

Commentary
Classification number:
Creator: Bonds, Bethani
Title: The color purple in its social context
Date: 2018
Subject heading: Walker, Alice, 1944- Color purple.

Many editions are classified in PS3573.A425 C6.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: PS3573.A425 C6 1982
Creator: Walker, Alice, 1944-
Title: The color purple

Commentary
Classification number: PS3573.A425 C6
Creator: Bonds, Bethani
Title: The color purple in its social context
Date: 2018
Subject heading: Walker, Alice, 1944- Color purple.

We copy the call number, excluding the publication date, so the beginning of the call number for the commentary is PS3573.A425 C6.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: PS3573.A425 C6 1982
Creator: Walker, Alice, 1944- 
Title: The color purple

Commentary
Classification number: PS3573.A425 C63
Creator: Bonds, Bethani 
Title: The color purple in its social context 
Date: 2018 
Subject heading: Walker, Alice, 1944- Color purple.

Now we append a 3 to the second cutter.

Our next step is to append digits to the second cutter, in order to represent the main entry. Before we can do that, though, we have to check the catalog.
There are already four commentaries on *The Color Purple* in this class number. The original class number is underlined on your screen. As you can see, it is identical for all of the commentaries.
Now the digit 3 that was appended is boldfaced and underlined. So far, the call numbers for each of the commentaries is identical. The digits at the end of the second cutter and the dates make them unique.

Let’s look at the digits.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

Example

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Call number</th>
<th>Entered under</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C6325</td>
<td>Alice Walker’s The color purple</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C634</td>
<td>Hubert, Christopher A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C635</td>
<td>Levy, Patricia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C639</td>
<td>Women’s issues in Alice Walker’s The color purple</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Three of the four commentaries have only one digit to represent the commentary, which is fine, but it is often a better idea to append two.
The commentary by Bond that we are cataloging has to fit between Alice, which was assigned the digits 25, and Hubert, which was assigned a 4.

We could assign it any digits between 2-6 and 3-9. Let’s use 28, because Bond is alphabetically much closer to Alice than it is to Hubert.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: PS3573.A425 C6 1982
Creator: Walker, Alice, 1944-
Title: The color purple

Commentary
Classification number: PS3573.A425 C6328 2018
Creator: Bonds, Bethani
Title: The color purple in its social context
Date: 2018
Subject heading: Walker, Alice, 1944- Color purple.

And we will add the date of publication of the commentary.

The full call number is: PS3573.A425 C6328 2018.
As we saw in the earlier example, this creates an orderly array of editions of the original work by date of publication, followed by commentaries arranged by the main entry.
Here is a second example of an original work that was assigned two cutter numbers.

We are cataloging *Thirty Years On: Evaluating Fraser’s Acid Rain Control*.

As always, we search the catalog to find the call number assigned to the original work.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: QH545.A17 F73 1989
Creator: Fraser, G. Alex (Glen Alexander), 1953-
Title: Acid rain control: potential forestry benefits ...

Commentary
Classification number:
Creator: Maxwell, Russell
Title: Thirty years on: evaluating Fraser’s Acid rain control
Date: 2019
Subject heading: Fraser, G. Alex (Glen Alexander), 1953-
Acid rain control.

It is QH545.A17 F73 1989.

Now we should check the schedule to ensure that there are no special instructions about classifying commentaries of works that are classified in this number.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: QH545.A17 F73 1989
Creator: Fraser, G. Alex (Glen Alexander), 1953-
Title: Acid rain control: potential forestry benefits ...

There are none. QH545.A17 is for acid rain as a special factor that influences the environment.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: QH545.A17 F73 1989
Creator: Fraser, G. Alex (Glen Alexander), 1953-
Title: Acid rain control: potential forestry benefits ...

Commentary
Classification number: QH545.A17 F73
Creator: Maxwell, Russell
Title: Thirty years on: evaluating Fraser’s Acid rain control
Date: 2019
Subject heading: Fraser, G. Alex (Glen Alexander), 1953-
Acid rain control.

Now we can begin to develop the call number for the commentary. We first copy the call number of the original work, except for the publication date.
Now we will append a 3 to the second cutter.

And finally, we assign digits to represent the main entry. But before we do that, we have to check the catalog to determine whether there are already any commentaries of Fraser’s work. In this case there are not, so we can simply add digits.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: QH545.A17 F73 1989
Creator: Fraser, G. Alex (Glen Alexander), 1953-
Title: Acid rain control: potential forestry benefits ...

Commentary
Classification number: QH545.A17 F73363
Creator: Maxwell, Russell
Title: Thirty years on: evaluating Fraser’s Acid rain control
Date: 2019
Subject heading: Fraser, G. Alex (Glen Alexander), 1953-
Acid rain control.

We chose to add 6-3. Maxwell falls about halfway through the alphabet and M is assigned a 5 or a 6 in the Cutter Table, and A is typically assigned a value of 3.
Commentary on the Second Cutter

Example

Original work
Classification number: QH545.A17 F73 1989
Creator: Fraser, G. Alex (Glen Alexander), 1953-
Title: Acid rain control: potential forestry benefits ...

Commentary
Classification number: QH545.A17 F73363 2019
Creator: Maxwell, Russell
Title: Thirty years on: evaluating Fraser’s Acid rain control
Date: 2019
Subject heading: Fraser, G. Alex (Glen Alexander), 1953-
Acid rain control.

Finally, we add the date of publication.
Sometimes a commentary is written about another commentary. The commentary being discussed is then treated as the original work. The call number of the original work is copied as usual, a 3 is appended, and the main entry is represented.
Commentary on a Commentary

- Commentary being discussed is the original work
- Follow the same procedure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Call number</th>
<th>Description of resource</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C6 1982</td>
<td>Original work by Walker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C634 1996</td>
<td>Commentary by Hubert</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We will revisit *The Color Purple* to demonstrate how this works.

As we saw, *The Color Purple* is classified at PS3573.A425 C6. For Hubert’s commentary, a 3 was appended to the second cutter and a digit was added to represent the main entry. Finally, the publication date was appended.
Commentary on a Commentary

- Commentary being discussed is the original work
- Follow the same procedure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Call number</th>
<th>Description of resource</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C6 1982</td>
<td>Original work by Walker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C634 1996</td>
<td>Commentary by Hubert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commentary about Hubert’s commentary, written by Audrey Khale</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Now we are cataloging a commentary by Audrey Khale, who is commenting on Hubert’s commentary.
Commentary on a Commentary

• Commentary being discussed is the original work
• Follow the same procedure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Call number</th>
<th>Description of resource</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C6 1982</td>
<td>Original work by Walker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C634 1996</td>
<td>Commentary by Hubert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C634</td>
<td>Commentary about Hubert's commentary, written by Audrey Khale</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We copy the call number assigned to Hubert’s commentary (except for the date, of course).
Commentary on a Commentary

- Commentary being discussed is the original work
- Follow the same procedure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Call number</th>
<th>Description of resource</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C6 1982</td>
<td>Original work by Walker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C634 1996</td>
<td>Commentary by Hubert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C6343</td>
<td>Commentary about Hubert's commentary, written by Audrey Khale</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We append a 3 to the second cutter.
Commentary on a Commentary

- Commentary being discussed is the original work
- Follow the same procedure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Call number</th>
<th>Description of resource</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C6 1982</td>
<td>Original work by Walker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C634 1996</td>
<td>Commentary by Hubert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C63434 2019</td>
<td>Commentary about Hubert's commentary, written by Audrey Khale</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

And append digits to represent the main entry, Khale, and the date.
Commentary on a Commentary

- Commentary being discussed is the original work
- Follow the same procedure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Call number</th>
<th>Description of resource</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C6 1982</td>
<td>Original work by Walker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C634 1996</td>
<td>Commentary by Hubert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C634344 2019</td>
<td>Commentary about Hubert’s commentary, written by Audrey Khale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS3573.A425 C635 2002</td>
<td>Commentary by Levy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This allows Khale’s commentary about Hubert’s commentary to file after Hubert’s commentary, and before Levy’s.
Finally, the Library of Congress sometimes acquires a commentary but does not own the original work. When that happens, it is necessary to determine what the call number would be if LC did own it.

Using that hypothetical call number, follow the procedures that we have demonstrated in this module.

If the original work is ever acquired, the cataloger will reverse engineer the commentary’s call number to determine the call number for the original work.
Exercises

Click when you are ready to begin